

HUL 360: Selected Topics in Philosophy
Ist Semester, 2018-19
Minor I

Instructions

Total marks: 20

- Make your answers as clear and precise as possible. Give concrete examples rather than vague generalisations. Avoid flowery language.
- Feel free to use Hindi words or phrases if you need to. You will not lose marks for spelling and grammar.

Background

The Cabinet of the Government of Punjab has decided to amend the Indian Penal Code (IPC), by adding s. 295AA according to which “whoever causes injury, damage or sacrilege to Sri Guru Granth Sahib, Srimad Bhagwad Geeta, Holy Quran and Holy Bible with the intention to hurt the religious feelings of the people, shall be punished with imprisonment for life.”

1. How should a follower of the Harm Principle analyse s. 295AA? (10 marks, 600-800 words)
2. How should a utilitarian analyse s. 295AA? (10 marks, 600-800 words)

HUL 360: Selected Topics in Philosophy
Ist Semester, 2018-19
Minor II

Instructions

Total marks: 20

- Make your answers as clear and precise as possible. Give concrete examples rather than vague generalisations. Avoid flowery language.
- Feel free to use Hindi words or phrases if you need to. You will not lose marks for spelling and grammar.

Q. 1 (15 marks)

Neitzche says: “Mistrust all in whom the impulse to punish is powerful.” What does he mean by this? What role does Nietzsche’s point have in Michael Moore’s defence of a retributive theory of punishment?

Q. 2 (5 marks)

According to some philosophers, the deterrence theory of punishment cannot account for the fact that the punishment for an offence should be proportional to its severity. What is the argument for this claim? Explain using examples.

HUL 360: Selected Topics in Philosophy
Ist Semester, 2018-19
Major

Q. 1 (25 marks)

The Criminal Law Amendment Act of 2013 was enacted in the aftermath of the “Nirbhaya” rape case of 2012, and made several changes to the law of rape as defined in the Indian Penal Code. These included changes to the definition of rape (s. 375) as well as changes to punishment for rape (s. 376). It introduced a new set of punishments for gang rape (s. 376D) and punishment for “repeat offenders” (s. 376E).

Earlier this year, the IPC was amended again to introduce S. 376AB, which makes it a separate offence to rape a woman under the age of twelve years. The crime is punishable by death.

Analyse the amendments listed above from the point of view of what you know about criminal justice, both in theory and in practice. If you were given the task of rewriting the law, which portions of it would you leave intact, and which would you change or delete? Rank these in order of priority.

HUL 360, Course Packet VIII
Rape amendments for Major Exam

रजिस्ट्री सं० डी० एल०—(एन)04/0007/2003—13

REGISTERED NO. DL—(N)04/0007/2003—13



भारत का राजपत्र
The Gazette of India

असाधारण

EXTRAORDINARY

भाग II—खण्ड 1

PART II—Section 1

प्राधिकार से प्रकाशित

PUBLISHED BY AUTHORITY

सं० 17] नई दिल्ली, मंगलवार, अप्रैल 2, 2013/चैत्र 12, 1935 (शक)
No. 17] NEW DELHI, TUESDAY, APRIL 2, 2013/CHAITRA 12, 1935 (SAKA)

इस भाग में भिन्न पृष्ठ संख्या दी जाती है जिससे कि यह अलग संकलन के रूप में रखा जा सके।
Separate paging is given to this Part in order that it may be filed as a separate compilation.

MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE

(Legislative Department)

New Delhi, the 2nd April, 2013/Chaitra 12, 1935 (Saka)

The following Act of Parliament received the assent of the President on the 2nd April, 2013, and is hereby published for general information:—

THE CRIMINAL LAW (AMENDMENT) ACT, 2013

No. 13 OF 2013

[2nd April, 2013]

AN ACT further to amend the Indian Penal Code, the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1973, the Indian Evidence Act, 1872 and the Protection of Children from Sexual Offences Act, 2012.

BE it enacted by Parliament in the Sixty-fourth Year of the Republic of India as follows:—

CHAPTER I

PRELIMINARY

- (1) This Act may be called the Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 2013.
- (2) It shall be deemed to have come into force on the 3rd day of February, 2013.

Short title and commencement.

CHAPTER II

AMENDMENTS TO THE INDIAN PENAL CODE

2. In the Indian Penal Code (hereafter in this Chapter referred to as the Penal Code), in section 100, after clause *Sixthly*, the following clause shall be inserted, namely:—

Amendment of section 100.

“*Seventhly*.—An act of throwing or administering acid or an attempt to throw or administer acid which may reasonably cause the apprehension that grievous hurt will otherwise be the consequence of such act.”

(6) If a person is convicted of the offence of trafficking of minor on more than one occasion, then such person shall be punished with imprisonment for life, which shall mean imprisonment for the remainder of that person's natural life, and shall also be liable to fine.

(7) When a public servant or a police officer is involved in the trafficking of any person then, such public servant or police officer shall be punished with imprisonment for life, which shall mean imprisonment for the remainder of that person's natural life, and shall also be liable to fine.

370A. (1) Whoever, knowingly or having reason to believe that a minor has been trafficked, engages such minor for sexual exploitation in any manner, shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than five years, but which may extend to seven years, and shall also be liable to fine.

Exploitation
of a trafficked
person.

(2) Whoever, knowingly or having reason to believe that a person has been trafficked, engages such person for sexual exploitation in any manner, shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than three years, but which may extend to five years, and shall also be liable to fine.

9. For sections 375, 376, 376A, 376B, 376C and 376D of the Penal Code, the following sections shall be substituted, namely:—

Substitution of
new sections
for sections
375, 376,
376A, 376B,
376C and
376D.

'375. A man is said to commit "rape" if he—

Rape.

(a) penetrates his penis, to any extent, into the vagina, mouth, urethra or anus of a woman or makes her to do so with him or any other person; or

(b) inserts, to any extent, any object or a part of the body, not being the penis, into the vagina, the urethra or anus of a woman or makes her to do so with him or any other person; or

(c) manipulates any part of the body of a woman so as to cause penetration into the vagina, urethra, anus or any part of body of such woman or makes her to do so with him or any other person; or

(d) applies his mouth to the vagina, anus, urethra of a woman or makes her to do so with him or any other person,

under the circumstances falling under any of the following seven descriptions:—

First.—Against her will.

Secondly.—Without her consent.

Thirdly.—With her consent, when her consent has been obtained by putting her or any person in whom she is interested, in fear of death or of hurt.

Fourthly.—With her consent, when the man knows that he is not her husband and that her consent is given because she believes that he is another man to whom she is or believes herself to be lawfully married.

Fifthly.—With her consent when, at the time of giving such consent, by reason of unsoundness of mind or intoxication or the administration by him personally or through another of any stupefying or unwholesome substance, she is unable to understand the nature and consequences of that to which she gives consent.

Sixthly.—With or without her consent, when she is under eighteen years of age.

Seventhly.—When she is unable to communicate consent.

Explanation 1.—For the purposes of this section, "vagina" shall also include *labia majora*.

Explanation 2.—Consent means an unequivocal voluntary agreement when the woman by words, gestures or any form of verbal or non-verbal communication, communicates willingness to participate in the specific sexual act:

Provided that a woman who does not physically resist to the act of penetration shall not by the reason only of that fact, be regarded as consenting to the sexual activity.

Exception 1.—A medical procedure or intervention shall not constitute rape.

Exception 2.—Sexual intercourse or sexual acts by a man with his own wife, the wife not being under fifteen years of age, is not rape.'

Punishment
for rape.

376. (1) Whoever, except in the cases provided for in sub-section (2), commits rape, shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment of either description for a term which shall not be less than seven years, but which may extend to imprisonment for life, and shall also be liable to fine.

(2) Whoever,—

(a) being a police officer, commits rape—

(i) within the limits of the police station to which such police officer is appointed; or

(ii) in the premises of any station house; or

(iii) on a woman in such police officer's custody or in the custody of a police officer subordinate to such police officer; or

(b) being a public servant, commits rape on a woman in such public servant's custody or in the custody of a public servant subordinate to such public servant; or

(c) being a member of the armed forces deployed in an area by the Central or a State Government commits rape in such area; or

(d) being on the management or on the staff of a jail, remand home or other place of custody established by or under any law for the time being in force or of a women's or children's institution, commits rape on any inmate of such jail, remand home, place or institution; or

(e) being on the management or on the staff of a hospital, commits rape on a woman in that hospital; or

(f) being a relative, guardian or teacher of, or a person in a position of trust or authority towards the woman, commits rape on such woman; or

(g) commits rape during communal or sectarian violence; or

(h) commits rape on a woman knowing her to be pregnant; or

(i) commits rape on a woman when she is under sixteen years of age;

or

(j) commits rape, on a woman incapable of giving consent; or

(k) being in a position of control or dominance over a woman, commits rape on such woman; or

(l) commits rape on a woman suffering from mental or physical disability; or

(m) while committing rape causes grievous bodily harm or maims or disfigures or endangers the life of a woman; or

(n) commits rape repeatedly on the same woman,

shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than ten years, but which may extend to imprisonment for life, which shall mean imprisonment for the remainder of that person's natural life, and shall also be liable to fine.

Explanation.—For the purposes of this sub-section,—

(a) "armed forces" means the naval, military and air forces and includes any member of the Armed Forces constituted under any law for the time being in force, including the paramilitary forces and any auxiliary forces that are under the control of the Central Government or the State Government;

(b) "hospital" means the precincts of the hospital and includes the precincts of any institution for the reception and treatment of persons during convalescence or of persons requiring medical attention or rehabilitation;

(c) "police officer" shall have the same meaning as assigned to the expression "police" under the Police Act, 1861;

(d) "women's or children's institution" means an institution, whether called an orphanage or a home for neglected women or children or a widow's home or an institution called by any other name, which is established and maintained for the reception and care of women or children.

376A. Whoever, commits an offence punishable under sub-section (1) or sub-section (2) of section 376 and in the course of such commission inflicts an injury which causes the death of the woman or causes the woman to be in a persistent vegetative state, shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than twenty years, but which may extend to imprisonment for life, which shall mean imprisonment for the remainder of that person's natural life, or with death.

Punishment for causing death or resulting in persistent vegetative state of victim.

376B. Whoever has sexual intercourse with his own wife, who is living separately, whether under a decree of separation or otherwise, without her consent, shall be punished with imprisonment of either description for a term which shall not be less than two years but which may extend to seven years, and shall also be liable to fine.

Sexual intercourse by husband upon his wife during separation.

Explanation.—In this section, "sexual intercourse" shall mean any of the acts mentioned in clauses (a) to (d) of section 375.

376C. Whoever, being—

(a) in a position of authority or in a fiduciary relationship; or

(b) a public servant; or

(c) superintendent or manager of a jail, remand home or other place of custody established by or under any law for the time being in force, or a women's or children's institution; or

(d) on the management of a hospital or being on the staff of a hospital, abuses such position or fiduciary relationship to induce or seduce any woman either in his custody or under his charge or present in the premises to have sexual intercourse with him, such sexual intercourse not amounting to the offence of rape, shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment of either description for a term which shall not be less than five years, but which may extend to ten years, and shall also be liable to fine.

Sexual intercourse by a person in authority.

Explanation 1.—In this section, "sexual intercourse" shall mean any of the acts mentioned in clauses (a) to (d) of section 375.

Explanation 2.—For the purposes of this section, *Explanation 1* to section 375 shall also be applicable.

Explanation 3.—"Superintendent", in relation to a jail, remand home or other place of custody or a women's or children's institution, includes a person holding any other office in such jail, remand home, place or institution by virtue of which such person can exercise any authority or control over its inmates.

Explanation 4.—The expressions "hospital" and "women's or children's institution" shall respectively have the same meaning as in *Explanation* to sub-section (2) of section 376.

Gang rape.

376D. Where a woman is raped by one or more persons constituting a group or acting in furtherance of a common intention, each of those persons shall be deemed to have committed the offence of rape and shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than twenty years, but which may extend to life which shall mean imprisonment for the remainder of that person's natural life, and with fine:

Provided that such fine shall be just and reasonable to meet the medical expenses and rehabilitation of the victim:

Provided further that any fine imposed under this section shall be paid to the victim.

Punishment for repeat offenders.

376E. Whoever has been previously convicted of an offence punishable under section 376 or section 376A or section 376D and is subsequently convicted of an offence punishable under any of the said sections shall be punished with imprisonment for life which shall mean imprisonment for the remainder of that person's natural life, or with death.'

Amendment of section 509.

10. In section 509 of the Penal Code, for the words "shall be punished with simple imprisonment for a term which may extend to one year, or with fine, or with both", the words "shall be punished with simple imprisonment for a term which may extend to three years, and also with fine" shall be substituted.

CHAPTER III

AMENDMENTS TO THE CODE OF CRIMINAL PROCEDURE, 1973

Amendment of section 26.

11. In the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1973 (hereafter in this Chapter referred to as the Code of Criminal Procedure), in section 26, in the proviso to clause (a), for the words, figures and letters "offence under section 376 and sections 376A to 376D of the Indian Penal Code", the words, figures and letters "offence under section 376, section 376A, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D or section 376E of the Indian Penal Code" shall be substituted. 2 of 1974. 45 of 1860.

Amendment of section 54A.

12. In section 54A of the Code of Criminal Procedure, the following provisos shall be inserted, namely—

"Provided that, if the person identifying the person arrested is mentally or physically disabled, such process of identification shall take place under the supervision of a Judicial Magistrate who shall take appropriate steps to ensure that such person identifies the person arrested using methods that person is comfortable with:



भारत का राजपत्र The Gazette of India

असाधारण

EXTRAORDINARY

भाग II — खण्ड 1

PART II — Section 1

प्राधिकार से प्रकाशित

PUBLISHED BY AUTHORITY

सं० 35] नई दिल्ली, शनिवार, अगस्त 11, 2018/ श्रावण 20, 1940 (शक)
No. 35] NEW DELHI, SATURDAY, AUGUST 11, 2018/SHRAVANA 20, 1940 (SAKA)

इस भाग में भिन्न पृष्ठ संख्या दी जाती है जिससे कि यह अलग संकलन के रूप में रखा जा सके।
Separate paging is given to this Part in order that it may be filed as a separate compilation.

MINISTRY OF LAW AND JUSTICE (Legislative Department)

New Delhi, the 11th August, 2018/Shravana 20, 1940 (Saka)

The following Act of Parliament received the assent of the President on the 11th August, 2018, and is hereby published for general information:—

THE CRIMINAL LAW (AMENDMENT) ACT, 2018

No. 22 OF 2018

[11th August, 2018.]

An Act further to amend the Indian Penal Code, Indian Evidence Act, 1872, the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1973 and the Protection of Children from Sexual Offences Act, 2012.

BE it enacted by Parliament in the Sixty-ninth Year of the Republic of India as follows:—

CHAPTER I

PRELIMINARY

- (1) This Act may be called the Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 2018.
- (2) It shall be deemed to have come into force on the 21st day of April, 2018.

Short title and commencement.

CHAPTER II

AMENDMENTS TO THE INDIAN PENAL CODE

- Amendment of section 166A. **2.** In the Indian Penal Code (hereafter in this Chapter referred to as the Penal Code), in section 166A, in clause (c), for the words, figures and letters "section 376C, section 376D", the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D, section 376DA, section 376DB" shall be substituted. 45 of 1860.
- Amendment of section 228A. **3.** In section 228A of the Penal Code, in sub-section (1), for the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D", the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376AB, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D, section 376DA, section 376DB" shall be substituted.
- Amendment of section 376. **4.** In section 376 of the Penal Code,—
 (a) in sub-section (1), for the words "shall not be less than seven years, but which may extend to imprisonment for life, and shall also be liable to fine", the words "shall not be less than ten years, but which may extend to imprisonment for life, and shall also be liable to fine" shall be substituted;
 (b) in sub-section (2), clause (i) shall be omitted;
 (c) after sub-section (2), the following sub-section shall be inserted, namely:—
 "(3) Whoever, commits rape on a woman under sixteen years of age shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than twenty years, but which may extend to imprisonment for life, which shall mean imprisonment for the remainder of that person's natural life, and shall also be liable to fine:
 Provided that such fine shall be just and reasonable to meet the medical expenses and rehabilitation of the victim:
 Provided further that any fine imposed under this sub-section shall be paid to the victim."
- Insertion of new section 376AB. **5.** After section 376A of the Penal Code, the following section shall be inserted, namely:—
 "376AB. Whoever, commits rape on a woman under twelve years of age shall be punished with rigorous imprisonment for a term which shall not be less than twenty years, but which may extend to imprisonment for life, which shall mean imprisonment for the remainder of that person's natural life, and with fine or with death:
 Provided that such fine shall be just and reasonable to meet the medical expenses and rehabilitation of the victim:
 Provided further that any fine imposed under this section shall be paid to the victim."
- Punishment for rape on woman under twelve years of age.
- Insertion of new sections 376DA and 376DB. **6.** After section 376D of the Penal Code, the following sections shall be inserted, namely:—
 "376DA. Where a woman under sixteen years of age is raped by one or more persons constituting a group or acting in furtherance of a common intention, each of those persons shall be deemed to have committed the offence of rape and shall be punished with imprisonment for life, which shall mean imprisonment for the remainder of that person's natural life, and with fine:
 Provided that such fine shall be just and reasonable to meet the medical expenses and rehabilitation of the victim:
 Provided further that any fine imposed under this section shall be paid to the victim."
- Punishment for gang rape on woman under sixteen years of age.

376DB. Where a woman under twelve years of age is raped by one or more persons constituting a group or acting in furtherance of a common intention, each of those persons shall be deemed to have committed the offence of rape and shall be punished with imprisonment for life, which shall mean imprisonment for the remainder of that person's natural life, and with fine, or with death:

Punishment for gang rape on woman under twelve years of age.

Provided that such fine shall be just and reasonable to meet the medical expenses and rehabilitation of the victim:

Provided further that any fine imposed under this section shall be paid to the victim."

7. In section 376E of the Penal Code, for the word, figures and letter "section 376D", the words, figures and letters "section 376AB or section 376D or section 376DA or section 376DB," shall be substituted.

Amendment of section 376E.

CHAPTER III

AMENDMENTS TO THE INDIAN EVIDENCE ACT, 1872

1 of 1872.

8. In section 53A of the Indian Evidence Act, 1872 (hereafter in this Chapter referred to as the Evidence Act), for the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D", the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376AB, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D, section 376DA, section 376DB" shall be substituted.

Amendment of section 53A.

9. In section 146 of the Evidence Act, in the proviso, for the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D", the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376AB, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D, section 376DA, section 376DB" shall be substituted.

Amendment of section 146.

CHAPTER IV

AMENDMENTS TO THE CODE OF CRIMINAL PROCEDURE, 1973

2 of 1974.

10. In the Code of Criminal Procedure, 1973 (hereafter in this Chapter referred to as the Code of Criminal Procedure), in section 26, in clause (a) of the proviso, for the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D", the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376AB, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D, section 376DA, section 376DB" shall be substituted.

Amendment of section 26.

11. In section 154 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, in sub-section (1),—

Amendment of section 154.

(i) in the first proviso, for the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D", the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376AB, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D, section 376DA, section 376DB," shall be substituted;

(ii) in the second proviso, in clause (a), for the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D", the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376AB, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D, section 376DA, section 376DB," shall be substituted.

12. In section 161 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, in sub-section (3), in the second proviso, for the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D", the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376AB, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D, section 376DA, section 376DB" shall be substituted.

Amendment of section 161.

13. In section 164 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, in sub-section (5A), in clause (a), for the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D", the words, figures and letters "section 376A, section 376AB, section 376B, section 376C, section 376D, section 376DA, section 376DB" shall be substituted.

Amendment of section 164.